

## COMMONWEALTH ★ ★ ★ POLICY CENTER ★ ★ ★

### **Answering the Top five arguments for gay marriage**

Advocates for redefining marriage have offered many arguments for its revision. However as the Proverb says “the one who states his case first seems right, until the other comes and examines him.” Here is a brief examination and answers to those objections.

#### **Who are you to tell me whom to love?**

- It depends upon what kind of love one is talking about. Is it storge—affection; phileo—friendship; eros—sexual; or agape—unconditional? Western civilization has always had a keen interest in the correct ordering of eros or sexual love.
- There are laws against adulterous, incestual, bestial, and polygamous “love.” Homosexual activity was banned at one time in all 50 states. Disordered sexuality has tremendous implications for society.

#### **Denying marriage “equality” is equivalent to antimiscegenation laws**

- All human beings have equal dignity, but not all human beings have the right to marry.
- Denial of marriage between people of different skin color was based upon the mistaken idea of superiority of one race over another.
- Cross racial unions meet the requirement of marriage in that they are complementary unions in a permanent and exclusive relationship.

#### **How does my gay marriage hurt your marriage?**

One might ask “How does my printing counterfeit \$100 bills hurt your wallet?”

Marriage is a pre-political institution that is rooted in nature and is for the common good of society. If it is redefined, it throws society into confusion, makes man/woman marriage arbitrary, and minimizes the importance of the real thing.

If sex complementarity is optional, then so is permanence and exclusivity. In other words if marriage is redefined and no longer between a man and a woman, then why should it be a permanent union? Or even an exclusive union? Dismissing marriage’s core requirement unravels marriage entirely.

## **The state should stay out of marriage**

- Privatizing marriage would have disastrous results for society since marriage between a man and woman is the foundational relationship in civil society. It is a complementary union bringing the two parts of humanity together in an exclusive, organic bodily union in which children come into existence.
- Where marriage breaks down or doesn't form, there is a greater burden on the state as it seeks to fill this domestic vacuum by refereeing lawsuits to determine paternity, visitation rights, child support and alimony.
- The state has a strong interest in that children have a safe, nurturing environment. Strong marriages are society's best tool for ensuring that children are born into stable families that will care for, educate, and train those children to be good people and good citizens. If mothers and fathers do not fulfill the responsibility for caring for the children they create, then third parties and civil governments will intervene.

## **More marriages, including same-sex, are good for children**

- Children do best in homes where they are raised by their married mother and father. They do better educationally, emotionally, and behaviorally.<sup>i</sup>
- “The burden of social science evidence supports the idea that gender-differentiated parenting is important for human development and that the contribution of fathers to childrearing is unique and irreplaceable.”<sup>ii</sup>
- “We should disavow the notion that ‘mommies can make good daddies,’ just as we should disavow the popular notion...that daddies can make good mommies.’... The two sexes are different to the core, and each is necessary—culturally and biologically—for the optimal development of a human being.”<sup>iii</sup>
- While several studies purport to show that same-sex parenting doesn't harm children. There is not one single study of same-sex parenting that meets the “standard of research to which top-quality social science aspires: large, random, and representative samples observed longitudinally.”<sup>iv</sup>
- Marriage is society's best guarantee of a limited government that stays out of family life.

---

<sup>i</sup> *Marriage and the Public Good: Ten Principles* (Princeton, N.J.: The Witherspoon Institute, 2008) 9-19.

<sup>ii</sup> David Popenoe, *Life without Father: Compelling New Evidence That Fatherhood and Marriage Are Indispensable for the Good of Children and Society* (New York: Free Press, 1996), 146.

<sup>iii</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>iv</sup> *What is Marriage? Man and Woman: A Defense*, Sherif Girgis, Ryan T. Anderson and Robert P. George (Encounter: New York, 2012), 60.